

Stakeholder mapping analysis: report on consultation workshop feedback for Madang

Development of REDD+ Stakeholder Engagement Plans in East New Britain, West New Britain and Madang Provinces of Papua New Guinea

Wildlife Conservation Society
December 2018

This project is funded by the Forest Carbon Partnership Facility, undertaken by the Wildlife Conservation Society in partnership with FORCERT and the Research and Conservation Foundation, and overseen by the FCPF REDD+ Project of the United Nations Development Program.

For more information contact:
Dr Ambroise Brenier abrenier@wcs.org

Country Director
Wildlife Conservation Society – Papua New Guinea Program



Introduction

A series of consultation workshops were held in November 2018 to present and gain provincial feedback on the Stakeholder Engagement Mapping and Analysis report drafted by the Wildlife Conservation Society. This represents the third deliverable of a project, coordinated by the Climate Change and Development Authority (CCDA), aimed at accelerating the implementation of PNG’s National REDD+ Strategy through ensuring the effective participation of key stakeholders in three pilot provinces (East New Britain, West New Britain, and Madang) via the development of province specific Stakeholder Engagement Plans and tools.

To introduce the project to provincial stakeholders, an inception workshop was held in the three pilot provinces in June 2018. Then, surveys were conducted in the three provinces between August and October 2018 to understand current stakeholder engagement, as it related to REDD+ preparedness. The results of these surveys, involving over 800 stakeholders, were compiled into a Stakeholder Engagement Mapping and Analysis report which was then circulated in November for feedback.

Presented here is a brief report on the consultation workshop recently held in Madang province, at Madang Lodge Hotel, Madang, on Thursday 8th November 2018 (9am–1pm) to present the results of the stakeholder mapping and analysis.

Objective of the workshop

The objective of this consultation workshop was to invite provincial authorities and key stakeholders to view and comment on the finding and recommendations of the stakeholder mapping and analysis surveys conducted in Madang province.

Participation and program

Peter Kambkai was contracted by WCS to organise the meeting. An invitation was sent out a week in advance. A total of 35 provincial participants were invited but only 11 materialised. Some stakeholders invited did not turn up for the consultation workshop because they were attending a one-week workshop facilitated by Oxfam International. Globe Cannery confirmed receiving the invitation as well as confirming to attend the workshop but did not attend. Madang Provincial Administration’s Community and Government Affairs, Lands and Natural Resources, Forestry and the Provincial Administrators Office confirmed receiving the invitation letters but did not confirm whether they would attend the workshop despite multiple attempts to contact from the respective offices. The Coffee Industry Corporation was not issued an invitation because their team was known to have a prior engagement in Goroka for a week and their office was closed. See Annex 1 for the full list of participants and the organisations they represented. Owing to only a few attendees arriving at the start time we delayed the meeting for an hour while follow-up attempts were made to reach out to key provincial staff.

Role (Madang)	Date	Female	Male
Observers	8-Nov-18	2	2
Organisers	8-Nov-18	0	3
Participants	8-Nov-18	3	8
Total		5	13

John Kuange from WCS then formally opening the meeting and welcoming the attendees. He said some words of appreciation to the Madang Provincial Government and other stakeholders for making time available to attend the consultation workshop. At the conclusion of the opening statements Nathan Whitmore proceeded with a power point presentation which was separated into three stages. At the end of each stage participants were given the opportunity to ask questions, make comments or ask for clarifications. The three stages were:

1. Background about REDD+, the stakeholder engagement project, and the results of the recent survey covering:
 - *An analysis of provincial engagement networks* which demonstrated that the Provincial Administration would be the single most important group for facilitating the interchange of information around REDD+ within the Province.
 - *An analysis of provincial typology* which demonstrated that there were so many similarities between the three provinces that there is no evidence to suggest separate training plans needed to be developed for each province. However, the analysis showed while there is much overlap, the provinces fall along a gradient with Madang and West New Britain being the least similar provinces. As a consequence it was suggested that while a single set of REDD+ tools could be produced as part of the project they use should be adapted to the local provincial conditions.
 - *An analysis of the key predictors in relation to REDD+ preparedness* which revealed that experience (age) and education were the best predictors of preparedness in individuals. Landowners were identified as the group least prepared for REDD+ implementation.
 - *An analysis of rural village concerns* which demonstrated major concern of village stakeholders was focused around issues associated with cash crop livelihoods. Many were concerned with the lack of assistance in terms of agricultural extension services, lack of advice on pest control, and deteriorating infrastructure relating to transport and markets.
2. The major impediments to REDD+ implementation identified by the survey
3. The draft recommendations of the report

During the meeting a spontaneous, long conversation was made involving most of the participants regarding gender, landownership and decision making. They shared insights into how women are involved in decisions on land matters in both patrilineal and matrilineal societies. A representative of a patrilineal society mentioned that decisions relating to land use used to be made by men but as a result of outside influences and education men were increasingly inviting women to partake in meetings relating to land use decision making. This was met with general agreement by the attendees. However, one participant hailing from a matrilineal society stated that although land is owned by women, much of the decisions regarding land use usually came down to men having the final say.

Following the presentation the participants were separated into two groups and asked to give feedback on the six draft recommendations of the report. All participants had an opportunity to share their thoughts on the presented recommendations and make comments. John Kuange, and Peter Kambkai of WCS acted as facilitators and scribes. Lunch was provided at 1 pm. In addition to the feedback given at the workshop participants were invited to submit any further comments to WCS by email. The feedback from each province was then aggregated and annotated in a table (see Feedback: Madang below) from which an overall feedback summary was made (See Annex 2). Based on this process a revised list of recommendations was made (see Annex 3). Owing to the lower than expected turnout in Madang, in part because of scheduling

clashes with CIC and Oxfam workshops, and a lack of email submissions the feedback received from Madang was substantially lower than the other two provinces.

.

Feedback: Madang

[Comments have been edited for clarity]

Ref	Theme	Within TOR	Province	REDD+ Action (within this project)	Stakeholder Recommendation	Stakeholder Feedback
1	Cross cutting	no	Madang	Internal protocols, projects, contact points, and jurisdictions within subnational government have to be mapped	Lines of compliance with regard to REDD+ need to be clearly delineated	PCCC needs to have a link with compliance down to the executing line agency (has to go up to the National level)
2	Recommendation 1	yes	Madang	No change	Already 7 members by constitution representing different groups	Concern that PCCC might be inert without civil society involvement
3	Recommendation 5	no	Madang	No change (as outside of TOR)	Build the capacity of line agencies on specific issues e.g. Forestry issues (PNGFA), and fisheries.	Lack of capacity in sectors to enforce laws
4	Cross cutting	no	Madang	Advocate for developing overarching Provincial Sustainable Development Committees	A single committee is required with strong linkages to statutory bodies.	Problem of duplicated roles within the various committees (which committee has jurisdiction?)
5	Recommendation 5	no	Madang	No change (as outside of TOR)	More awareness, more training to local community awareness facilitators	Lack of information on REDD+ at the community level
6	Cross cutting	no	Madang	No change (as outside of TOR)	MPA should have REDD+ Officer both male and female in Madang	No REDD+ officer in province to oversee REDD+
7	Recommendation 1	yes	Madang	No change (pre-existing in current recommendations)	Comment only	Provincial climate change committee has been established and sworn in. This will be the hub that will look at all activities including REDD+ and climate change.

8	Recommendation 1	no	Madang	No change (pre-existing in current recommendations)	Comment only	Note: PCCC was sworn in and endorsed for the province. Next year when the provincial plan is actioned, PCCC will be live.
9	Communication	no	Madang	No change (as outside of TOR)	Outside of TOR	Develop school materials that will be incorporated or integrated into school teaching material and endorsed at the national education level so that it is a compulsory subject to be taught and examined.

Annex 1: List and contact details of participants

Ref	Name	Organisation	Role	Contact details	Sex
1	Terence Barambi	CCDA	Observer	NA	M
2	Lydia Nenai Bobola	UNDP	Observer	75208208	F
3	Samson Kupale	UNDP	Observer	73413816	M
4	Lydia Nenai Bobola	UNDP	Observer	75208208	F
5	Nathan Whitmore	WCS	Organiser	72284379	M
6	Peter Kambkai	WCS	Organiser	74338469	M
7	John Kuange	WCS	Organiser	71740383	M
8	Bill Kiatig	Baitabag village	Participant	79334918	M
9	Patricia Salum	Country Women's Association	Participant	71312600	F
10	Tabitha Waka	Country Women's Association	Participant	70211284	F
11	Emma Fulelek	Country Women's Association	Participant	70211284	F
12	Greg Serar	Fisheries	Participant	73720424	M
13	Roy Milling	Health environment	Participant	71350190	M
14	Rudolph Mongallee	MPA	Participant	73103380	M
15	Peter Sagerom	MPA commerce	Participant	79073512	M
16	Kenneth Mamus	PNGFA	Participant	71787570	M
17	Frank Don	REMPI	Participant	72481618	M
18	Wesley Triugni	World Vision	Participant	71104306	M

Annex 2: Feedback all provinces combined

Based on the feedback received from the consultation workshops and from direct submission from various institutions (see Annex 4) we have altered the Stakeholder Engagement Mapping and Analysis report in a number of respects. The major points are summarised below:

Barriers to provincial implementation of REDD+

Participants at the consultation workshops identified that there were a number of jurisdictional challenges with regard to PCCC including a lack of budgetary support, no clear statutory mandate for its existence, and no linkages or protocols for enforcement and compliance with executing line agencies. In most cases provincial administrations are waiting for both a letter from CCDA to activate the committee and for CCDA to clarify the role of the PCCC. Of the three provinces Madang has the most advanced PCCC with the committee having already been formed.

The authors of this report are concerned that the PCCC is a separate body to the Provincial Forestry Management Committee (PFMC), which is the legislated provincial consultative body that advises on forestry projects. The PFMC is charged with coordination on forest management under the Forestry Act 1991:

Section 30:

- (a) *to provide a forum for consultation and co-ordination on forest management between the National Government and Provincial Governments, forest resource owners and special interest groups*

but the Provincial Climate Change Committee's role, outlined by CCDA's stipulated Terms of Reference, is charged with provincial sector coordination elements which align with REDD+:

Function 4:

- (4.1) *Provincial Sectoral Coordination: promote coordination, integration and facilitation among sectors such as but not restricted to agriculture, fishery, forestry, water resource, transport, climate induced migration, human settlement and infrastructure, to ensure a holistic approach to climate change adaptation and mitigation including eco-system friendly measures.*
- (4.4) *Support adaptation and mitigation programs, projects and reform initiatives that reduce greenhouse gas emissions.*

Given that REDD+ is a primarily a forest management mechanism we suggest that such jurisdictional overlap is counterproductive and will inevitably lead to confusion. Not only is sectoral alignment in land-use planning required for REDD+ but other PNG national government initiatives such as the National Strategy For Responsible Sustainable Development (StaRS) and the PNG Protected Area Policy presumably require similar alignments. As a result we advocate that the government of Papua New Guinea investigates the practicality of establishing a singular multi-stakeholder consultative body in each province tasked with screening plans for large scale development, forestry, agriculture, and infrastructure projects ensuring that they follow legislated protocols and are consistent with provincial and national land-use policies. Many workshop participants suggested that such a body could be named the Provincial Sustainable Development Committee.

Additionally, many participants voiced concerns over how REDD+ initiatives including the PCCC were going to be funded. In this regard we suggest the forthcoming REDD+ Finance and Investment Plan should clearly outline the subnational budget allocations. Some participants advocated that provinces need to develop individual REDD+ policies, however, we suggest that what may be required, as a first step, is a national guidance document authored by the Department of National Planning and Monitoring, which outlines how development decisions should be resolved when there are conflicting land-use plans, concessions, or permits in play.

It is clear that the largest barrier to the successful implementation of REDD+ at the provincial level is a highly convoluted and bureaucratic system of often poorly linked governance structures. Such poorly connected systems can be expected to lead to information silos. In many cases the protocols between national agencies and the various levels and divisions within subnational government are not understood, and in some situations may not actually exist. For this reason the capacity development training program will, as a priority, focus on the mapping of the existing roles and responsibilities between the different subnational actors as a first step in identifying issues connected with communication and reporting. Initially, the capacity development training program will, at a minimum, have to include actors from the PFMC, PCCC (or equivalent), representatives from the District Development Authorities, PNGFA and DAL, as well as some external representatives of key stakeholder groups.

Harnessing the power of existing informal networks and business initiatives

The original report and its analyses underestimated the extent to which church and business organisations are involved in distributing livelihood information and involved in advocacy for women and marginalised groups. It is clear that church networks have strong advocacy programs and often function as an alternate route for distributing livelihood information to rural communities. Concurrently, we were made aware of sophisticated business initiatives which specifically target women such as New Britain Palm Oil Ltd's *Lus Frut Mamas* program. Similarly we were informed that PNGFA operates a *Women In Forestry Network* (WIFIN). While WIFIN currently focuses on the health and social welfare of the members based at the PNGFA headquarters they are planning to extend the membership to the women in the provinces and across the wider industry in future.

Business initiatives extend beyond gender and, at least in some cases, include adjunct forestry management strategies such as New Britain Palm Oil Ltd's proactive program on fire control. It is currently unclear how many similar business initiatives are currently in existence. Workshop participants also identified local chambers of commerce as useful access points to involve businesses.

From our consultation workshops is clear that provincial REDD+ initiatives should draw and build upon initiatives already active in their provinces and that these should be mapped as part of the capacity development training program.

Community engagement

While this project aims to develop the foundations for provincial REDD+ implementation (but is not attempting to develop a comprehensive program for its national implementation) preparatory communication materials for community outreach are being developed in Tok Pisin. However, as pointed out by stakeholders in East New Britain there are some very remote communities in the province who are illiterate (and possibly non-Tok Pisin speakers) for whom any sort of engagement will present logistic and ethical challenges. However, given the short time frame of this project at this stage we will only focus on developing simplified communication tools for Tok Pisin speaking communities. Workshop participants also identified

social media, especially Facebook, as a viral communication mechanism which is rapidly expanding in its use across PNG due, and advocated its use as a comparatively cheap way of engaging with a wider audience on issues related to REDD+.

Concerns over land-use planning and ILGs

Some feedback extended into issues of national sustainable land-use planning and issues relating to Incorporated Land Groups (ILGs) which, while outside the terms of reference for this project, have been annotated in Annex 4 for the purposes of record keeping. Of particular note is that participants identified that the formation of ILGs risk marginalising the role of women in decision making. They point out that in practice ILGs are controlled by a limited number of men, and in this way disenfranchise the decision making powers of traditional landowners. Further to this, ILGs stand to negatively affect matrilineal societies by effectively stripping from women their traditional role as it relates to land ownership.

Annex 3: Revised Recommendations

Governance

In order to overcome the possibility of jurisdiction confusion from a number of parallel committees involved in REDD+ and land-use activities we recommend that the government of Papua New Guinea investigates the practicality of establishing a singular multi-stakeholder consultative body in each province tasked for screening plans for large scale development, forestry, agriculture, and infrastructure projects and ensuring they follow legislated protocols and are consistent with provincial and national land-use policies. Such a body, possibly named the Provincial Sustainable Development Committee, would subsume any similar roles currently undertaken by other provincial committees.

Capacity

On the basis of our analysis and stakeholder feedback we suggest improved capacity to undertake REDD+ in the pilot provinces of East New Britain, West New Britain, and Madang could be best addressed through the development of a capacity development training program (and associated tools) which seeks to:

1. *Using the pre-existing Provincial Climate Change Committees as a hub for improved communication between all provincial level stakeholders*
2. *Encouraging the provincial administration to proactively engage with national departments and authorities to implement national REDD+ strategy (and advocate for improved national infrastructure and technical assistance for the support of rural livelihoods)*
3. *Undertaking outreach to sensitise both business and communities to the necessity of community level land-use planning*
4. *Promoting the inclusion of women and vulnerable groups in decision making as part of an approach to move towards integrated land-use planning*
5. *Increasing awareness for all stakeholders on:*
 - a. *landowner rights*
 - b. *climate change*
 - c. *the necessity of free, prior and informed consent*
 - d. *subnational administration contact points for land-use (i.e. REDD+) related issues*
 - e. *avenues for grievance redress and reporting of illegal forestry or land-use activities*
 - f. *basics of village future-proofing (as an introduction to land-use planning)*
6. *Increasing awareness for businesses, civil society and subnational government on:*
 - a. *the direction of REDD+ in PNG*
7. *Targeting the initial capacity development training program at a representative group of people from the Provincial Climate Change Committees, Provincial Forest Management Committees, Provincial and District planning units, District Development Authorities, representatives of provincial church, business and non-government organisations, and provincial officers of PNGFA and DAL.*

Workshop pictures



Breakout group 1 at Madang Workshop – photo credit Nathan Whitmore (WCS)



Breakout group 2 at Madang Workshop – photo credit Nathan Whitmore (WCS)